

“Mine Is Better!” Teaching Argument Through Evaluation

Kerrie Johnson johnsonkerrie@elyriaschools.org

Angela Perkins perkinsangela@elyriaschools.org

Kerrie Johnson

Personal Favorite Book

Favorite Book to Teach

The Kite Runner
Khaled Hosseini

Years of Teaching Experience

10

Random Fact

I was a collegiate swimmer but suffered a career-ending injury while taking the garbage out one night in the dorm. It required stitches, which can't get wet, ending my young career.



Loooooove our jobs.

We enjoy co-planning our preps and long walks down the hallway.

Hilarious.

Clearly sports were not meant for us.

Personal Favorite Book

The Alchemist
Paulo Coelho

Favorite Book to Teach

Speak
Laurie Halse Anderson

Years of Teaching Experience

12

Random Fact

I played CYO basketball in 5-8 grades. I took one shot my entire career and scored zero points. I did, however author a book entitled The Benchwarmers.

Angie Perkins

Why Use Evaluation for Building Argument?

- Opinions are like noses, we all have them ... evaluation moves BEYOND our own opinion to build the argument
- Places all options on equal playing ground
- Provides data/solid reasons to back up argument (not just “cause it’s the best”)
- Helps students navigate our consumer-driven culture. More options = more research necessary to make informed choices



Which Is Better?

Criteria	Option 1:	Option 2:	Option 3:
1.			
2.			
3.			
4.			
5.			

Claim: _____

Evidence: _____

Reasoning: _____

Counterclaim: _____

Which Is Better?

Criteria	Option 1: Five Guys	Option 2: In-n-Out Burger	Option 3: Shake Shack
1. Burgers	4 -- lots of toppings, sesame seed buns	4 -- fresh meat only, special sauce	4 -- 100% all natural, special sauce
2. Fries	3 -- greasy and soggy, peanut oil	2 -- handcut, often soggy	5- crinkle cut, always crispy
3. Milkshakes	3 -- 10 mix-in, not in all locations	2- only 3 flavors	5 -- 7-8 flavors, made from custard
4. Locations	5 -- EVERYWHERE	2 -- West Coast only	3 -- in many states and international, but not Ohio :((SOON!!)
5. "other" stuff on menu	4 -- hot dog, bacon, grilled cheese, no veg option	3 -- secret menu, no veg option other than grilled cheese	5 -- chicken, hot dogs, portobello mushroom "burger", "local" burger for the city they're in
TOTAL	19	13	22

Between Five Guys, In-in-Out Burger, and Shake Shack, Shake Shack is the best burger place. Between their burgers, fries, milkshakes, locations, and other items on the menu, Shake Shack is routinely better than the other two. Shake Shack's burgers, according to their website, are made from 100% natural beef and are served on a potato bun with a special sauce. This isn't very different from In-in-Out's burger, but In-in-Out uses iceberg lettuce, and Shake Shack uses leaf lettuce, which I prefer. The fries at Shake Shack are crinkle cut and always crispy; sometimes the fries at both Five Guys and In-n-Out are soggy and greasy. Because Shake Shack uses custard for their milkshakes, in addition to having many flavors of milkshakes, you can also just get the custard in a cup or a cone, or as a sundae. If you are a vegetarian or don't feel like a burger, you can order a portobello mushroom as your "burger," a chicken sandwich, or a hot dog. You can enjoy Shake Shack all over the country, as well as internationally because they have so many locations. Some may say that Five Guys are better because they are in more locations in the country, their fries are hand cut, and they have more toppings for your burger. Others might say that In-in-Out is the best because they have such a simple menu that everything they cook they cook well. In-in-Out is also the original "burger-fry-milkshake" place on the West Coast. Even though others might feel differently, Shake Shack is still the best burger place.

Which Is Better?

Criteria	Option 1: Five Guys	Option 2: In-n-Out Burger	Option 3: Shake Shack
1. Burgers	4 -- lots of toppings, sesame seed buns	4 -- fresh meat only, special sauce	4 -- 100% all natural, special sauce
2. Fries	3 -- greasy and soggy, peanut oil	2 -- handcut, often soggy	5 -- crinkle cut, always crispy
3. Milkshakes	3 -- 10 mix-in, not in all locations	2 -- only 3 flavors	5 -- 7-8 flavors, made from custard
4. Locations	5 -- EVERYWHERE	2 -- West Coast only	3 -- in many states and international, but not Ohio :((SOON!!)
5. "other" stuff on menu	4 -- hot dog, bacon, grilled cheese, no veg option	3 -- secret menu, no veg option other than grilled cheese	5 -- chicken, hot dogs, portobello mushroom "burger", "local" burger for the city they're in
TOTAL	19	13	22

Claim: (Option with the highest score) is the best.

Evidence: Describe the criteria used to judge which option is the best.

Reasoning: Explain the highest criteria scores from the best option.

Counterclaim: Offer a counter argument for the other options using each option's highest scoring criteria.

Classroom Application

- “Best of...” your city (ice cream, pizza place, park, activity)
- Best novel your class read (characters, setting, literary elements)
- Best Epic Hero
- AIR Practice test (FDR and LBJ State of the Union Addresses)
- Best Predator (Science classes)
- Best Composer/Song (Music class)
- Best Painting (Art class)
- Strongest Leader (Social Studies)